

# Allied Academies National Conference

Myrtle Beach, South Carolina  
April 7-11, 1999

## Academy of Marketing Studies

### Proceedings

#### *Affiliates*

*International Academy for Case Studies*  
*Academy of Entrepreneurship*  
*Academy of Accounting and Financial Studies*  
*Academy of Managerial Communications*  
*Academy of Educational Leadership*  
*Academy of Marketing Studies*  
*Academy of Strategic and Organizational Leadership*  
*Academy of Free Enterprise Education*  
*Academy of Information and Management Sciences*  
*Academy for Studies in Business Law*  
*Academy for Economics and Economic Education*

#### *Journals*

*Journal of the International Academy for Case Studies*  
*Academy of Entrepreneurship Journal and the Entrepreneurial Executive*  
*Academy of Accounting and Financial Studies Journal*  
*Academy of Managerial Communications Journal*  
*Academy of Educational Leadership Journal*  
*Academy of Marketing Studies Journal*  
*Academy of Strategic and Organizational Leadership Journal*  
*The Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*  
*Academy of Information and Management Sciences Journal*  
*Academy for Studies in Business Law Journal*  
*Economics and Economic Education Research Journal*

---

Allied Academies, Inc.  
An International Non Profit Association  
of Scholars and Practitioners

PO Box 2689, Cullowhee, NC 28723  
Voice 828-293-9151; FAX 828-293-9407  
[www.alliedacademies.org](http://www.alliedacademies.org)

# **Proceedings of the Academy of Marketing Studies**

**April 7-11, 1999  
Myrtle Beach, South Carolina**

**Jo Ann and Jim Carland  
Co-Editors  
Western Carolina University**

**The Proceedings of the  
Academy of Marketing Studies  
are published by the  
Allied Academies, Inc., PO Box 2689, Cullowhee, NC, 28723.**

**The Academy of Marketing Studies is an affiliate of the Allied Academies, an international, non-profit association of scholars whose purpose is to support and encourage the exchange of knowledge.**

**Copyright 1999 by the Allied Academies, Inc.**

# Proceedings of the Academy of Marketing Studies

## Table of Contents

THE EFFECTS OF YOUTH EMPLOYMENT ON THEIR BUYING DECISIONS .....	1
M.J. Alhabeeb, University of Massachusetts, Amherst	
MARKETING EDUCATION ON THE INTERNET: CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION .....	11
Edith Hibbert, MPM Graduate: WCU James W. Pearce, Western Carolina University	
THE ESSENTIAL FERDINAND de SAUSSURE: PARADIGMATIC AND SYNTAGMATIC DIMENSIONS OF VISUAL RHETORIC .....	20
Val Larsen, Truman State University Neil D. Gilchrist, Truman State University Newell D. Wright, James Madison University	
MATERIALISM AND VALUE JUDGMENTS: FOUR PERSPECTIVES .....	28
Val Larsen, Truman State University M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University Newell D. Wright, James Madison University	
AD POD EFFECTS IN TV ADVERTISING: ORDER, ADJACENCY, AND INFORMATIONAL\EMOTIONAL APPEAL .....	33
Stacey Manning, Truman State University Val Larsen, Truman State University	

# THE EFFECTS OF YOUTH EMPLOYMENT ON THEIR BUYING DECISIONS

**M.J. Alhabeeb, University of Massachusetts, Amherst**

## ABSTRACT

*Using data from the public school system, this study examines a youth profile of employment and spending by identifying the employed and unemployed youths, the extent of their labor force participation, and how much money they earn in the labor market. It estimates the youths' overall purchasing power and examines how they spend their money. Youths' buying decisions are differentiated based on their employment status and employment intensity. Major findings reveals that employed youths appeared to spend more on food, drinks and snacks and on clothing and personal care items and less on entertainment and transportation in comparison with those youths who are unemployed. (This study is based on research supported by the Cooperative State Research, Extension, and Education Service, U.S. Department of Agriculture, Massachusetts Experiment Station under Project No. MAS00778-0173591 Hatch.)*

## INTRODUCTION

The debate over the role and effects of the labor force participation of youth has intensified as the number of school-age adolescents joining the work force has dramatically increased in the last few decades resulting in a big boost in their purchasing power. Marketers, along with parents, schools, professionals as well as policy makers are continuously engaging in this debate to evaluate the returns of the early entry of youngsters to the adults' world of paid employment and mature and independent decision making. Never before had the teenagers so massively flocked the workplace and so impressively earned as they have been in the last few decades. Two of the authorities on adolescence warned more than a decade ago that we may fail to note the employment of teens and its unique character or to ponder its larger economic and social significance (Greenberger and Steinberg, 1986). It is therefore warranted to further study the multifaceted impacts of adolescent employment for it has evolved to be such a common feature of our economic and social landscape.

There is a substantial body of research and literature on the effects of the extent, timing, and nature of adolescent employment on a variety of academic, behavioral, and socioeconomic outcomes related to those adolescents and their families (e.g., Bachman et al., 1981, 1986, 1993; Bachman, 1983; D'Amico, 1984; Hotchkiss, 1982, 1986; Greenberger and Steinberg, 1983, 1986; Greenberger et al., 1980, 1981; Mortimer and Finch, 1986; Mortimer and Yamoor, 1987; Mortimer et al., 1990, 1992; Safyer et al., 1995; Steinberg et al., 1981, 1982; Steinberg and Dornbusch, 1992; Stern et al., 1990). However, much less research has been done on the impact of the part-time jobs of youths on their decision making in the market.

The enormous current and future purchasing power of adolescents and the timing and complexity of the market responses make it necessary to study the consumer behavior of this segment of population, especially those who hold part-time jobs and steady income. Two other facts make

it important to study the employed teens and their spending habits: First, people's major patterns of spending are most likely to develop during their adolescence and continue throughout their adult life. Secondly, problems related to adolescents' money, spending, and employment are considered among the major sources of family conflict and, ultimately, among the major factors in both market performance and family well-being.

## **OBJECTIVES**

In addition to identifying the employed youths and the extent of their labor force participation, this study examines how much money youths earn in the labor market, estimate their overall purchasing power and examine how they spend their money. The study further examines the effects of youth employment on the ways these youths decide on the goods and services they buy in the market by differentiating their buying decisions based on their employment status and employment intensity.

## **YOUTH EMPLOYMENT AND SPENDING**

Earlier in our history, youth could not go to school when their families needed their labor for they made significant contributions to the economic welfare of their families. Children of affluent families, on the other hand, dedicated their time and energy to their school work as there was no need for their family business, household work or market work. In both cases whether children worked for their families or not, they rarely had to make decisions on their purchases since such decisions were for their families to make. In today's world, working and going to school are no longer mutually exclusive. It has become familiar in our society to see teenagers holding part-time jobs while simultaneously attending school. Also earning from paid employment in the labor market and deciding on own spending are no longer rare. Further, a significant portion of today's youths make purchase decisions on their families' behalf. Trachenberg (1986) estimated that at least 20% of families' supermarket purchases were made by teenagers. Zollo (1995) stated that when teens' purchases include what they buy for their families, their expenditures would rise to an amount equal to half of the U.S. defence budget.

Since the demand for adolescent labor is inextricably tied to economic changes, today's adolescent employment is qualitatively different from that of the past. The demand for farm labor, factory labor, and skilled trades has been overwhelmingly replaced by the demand for labor in the service sector such as store clerks and fast food workers. Furthermore, the motivation of today's youth workers and their economic and social background are different from those of their earlier counterparts. Their motivation is chiefly concerned with sustaining the materialistic life-style they have become accustomed to, and their socioeconomic background is no longer defined by poverty. Bronfenbrenner (1986) stated that "not so long ago, it was the children of blue-collar families and of the poor who predominated in the youth labor force (but) today the earliest and most numerous entrants into the world of work are the children of the well-to-do and well-educated" (p. 15)

According to data collected by the National Study of Families and Households, 60 percent of both boys and girls aged 16 to 18 were employed (Mortimer et al., 1990). Guadagno (1991) estimated that 47 percent of two-parents families had at least one employed teenager. The mean

annual earnings for teens living in two-earner families was estimated at \$2,611, and that of teens living in one-earner families was estimated at \$2,704 (Guadagno, 1992). One source of governmental statistics indicate that in 1993 almost half of the older teen students (16-19) were in the labor force (U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, 1995). By 1997, the labor force participation rate of youths 16 to 19 years old averaged 51.7 percent of all teenage population. However, the younger segment of youths, age 16 to 17 were less likely to be employed. Their employment rate averaged 34.7 percent (U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, 1998). Around 70 percent of employed youths worked 34 hours or less per week according to U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics. During the academic year, employed juniors in high schools averaged 18.6 hours per week while the employed seniors averaged 23.5 hours per week.(Williams, et. al, 1996).

The high rate of youth employment and the volume of their earnings create a large and highly specified consumer market . American youths spend over \$109 billion a year (St.John,1995) which makes them a natural target for marketers and rewarding subject for more sophisticated marketing campaigns. There has been a circular feed-back effect between the youth demand on their desired goods and services and the market response to such a demand. Silberman (1978) identified this circle by noting that “the size of young people’s discretionary spending has led businessmen to direct much of their sales effort at the youth market which, in turn, has increased young people’s need for more and more discretionary income.” Higher discretionary income would more likely be obtained by seeking more employment.

In today’s market, there is a significant purchasing power of children in general and youths in particular feeding the most lucrative businesses and industries and creating more and more investment opportunities. Zollo (1995a) estimated that youths' spending was close to a staggering \$100 billion a year. In 1994, youths spent \$63 billion of their own money on personal needs, according to Teenage Research Unlimited (1994). Youths' spending has particularly increased during the 1980s and 1990s. According to Tootelian and Gaedeke (1992), expenditures by youths increased nearly 43 percent in the 1980s despite a 15.5 percent decline in the teenage population. Furthermore, in 1991, youths spent a total of \$82 billion, an increase of 3.8% over the \$79 billion spent in 1990 (Bailey, 1992; O'Neill, 1992). Such an increase in one year was considerable, given the fact that during that time the economy suffered a recession and that the youth population had decreased by 300,000 between 1990 and 1991 (O'Neill, 1992). By 1994, youths had an aggregate income of \$96 billion, up from \$86 billion in 1993 (Zollo, 1995b). A 1994 national survey by America's Research Group (ARG) revealed that an average youth visits the shopping mall at least eight times a month and that nine out of ten youths make at least one purchase a visit, spending an average of \$33. With this impressive purchasing power, and an additional estimated total of \$10 billion in savings, youths may constitute a far more sophisticated set of buyers than is often thought (Tootelian and Gaedeke, 1992).

The percentage of high school students entering into the labor force is so much higher in the United States compared with other industrialized countries such as Japan and those in western Europe. Greenberger and Steinberg (1986) attributes such differential to three major factors: (a) the educational system in those countries is more demanding than that of the United State for it is characterized by a greater emphasis on educational achievements, (b) the structure of the economies in these countries does not operate with service and retail sectors as gigantic as those of the United States. Those sectors would typically offer the most abundant opportunities for part-time employment. Moreover, it appears that young people in the United States have developed a higher

interest than that of their counterparts in the acquisition of expensive and luxurious goods. This, coupled with inflation, have clearly fueled adolescents' desire to earn their own income. Finally, (c) is the social and political priorities in those countries where the currents run strongly against practices that would permit or encourage students to hold jobs which would otherwise be needed by out-of-work adults or youth who are no longer enrolled in school.

Regarding gender differentials in the labor force participation for teenagers, Greenberger and Steinberg (1983) found that similar to the sex differences in the adult occupational structure, adolescents first job was significantly segregated by sex, girls worked fewer hours per week than boys, girls earned lower hourly wages than boys, and the hourly wages were generally higher in job types which were dominated by males. Mortimer et al. (1990) confirmed that boys received higher wages than girls but found no significant gender differences in hours of work, complexity of work, and teens' perceptions of their jobs. They, however, found that girls obtained their first job earlier than boys, but boys tended more than girls to increase the intensity of their employment as they moved from job to another. Yamoore and Mortimer (1990) found that although employment for both genders increased with age, boys were more likely to be employed than girls. They also found that teens' satisfaction with life appeared to be enhanced for younger boys while diminished for older girls.

There are also differentials in teenagers' employment across the family structures or household organization. Douthitt (1991) found that teens living with one parent spent more time in paid work than their peers living with both parents. Zick and Allen (1996) confirmed this finding for female teens. They found that girls in single-mother families tended to spend more time in paid employment and boys in single-mother families tended to spend less time in school work than did their counterparts in two-parents families. They also found that both boys and girls increasingly shifted their time out of housework and school work into time for paid employment. Guadagno (1992) found that teens were more likely to work for paid employment when both parents, rather than one, were employed. Also, employed teens were more likely to be from families who are white, home-owner, and have a higher socioeconomic status.

In their study on parents' reaction to youth work, Phillips and Sandstrom (1990) found that parental views on teens' employment were generally favorable, and that mothers and fathers views were quite similar. About how prevalent youth work was, only one of four parents thought that too many teens were employed. Parents thought both boys and girls should start work at a mean age of 13.3 years. However, parents with higher educational aspirations for their children thought teenagers should start work earlier. The majority of parents thought teens' work had no effect on the school performance, teens' behavior, and their relationships with their working teens. However, only one half of the parents thought that their employed teens had become financially independent of the family. Youths' financial independence would most likely translate into independence in decision making where youths would entirely make their own buying decisions.

## METHODS

### Sample and Procedure:

The source of data in this study was a sample of 511 teenagers, 15 to 19 years old, that was randomly drawn from high school students enrolled in the public school district in a large city of the New England region. Three different socioeconomic levels from the predominantly lower-income to the predominantly upper-income neighborhoods were represented in the sample. Survey questionnaires were distributed in selected classes with the help of teachers and a research assistant who was available in those classes at the time of administering the survey for questions and clarifications of terms and procedures. The questionnaire contained a total of 37 items with a page of instructions and explanations. Eleven items concerned the individual and family demographic and socioeconomic characteristics. The rest of the items were related to youths' work and money. The questionnaire required 20-25 minutes to be completed. All completed questionnaires were collected and returned back in the same day they were administered. About 8 percent of all completed questionnaires had to be discarded for inconsistent and invalid responses.

### Variables and Analysis:

The characteristic variables were in two groups, youths' characteristics and family characteristics. Youth characteristics variables included age, gender, having an allowance, and income. Youth income is the total money received per week including earnings, allowances, gift money and others. Family characteristics included family type, education, marital status, race, and family income. There were two variables for youth employment, employment status which was reflected by two categories, employed (having a part-time job) and unemployed (not having a part-time job); and employment intensity which was also reflected by two categories, working less than 20 hours a week, and working 20 or more hours a week. Youth buying decisions were reflected by youth expenditures in five major categories of purchases (Alhabeeb, 1996, 1997). These variables were measured by the ratio of expenditures in selected categories to total income. The selected categories of Youth purchases are:

- Food,drink and Snacks: includes all food and beverages a youth would buy for self or others by his/her own desire, excluding what is bought by youths to help the family, and what is bought by the family for youths.
- Clothing and personal care: includes outerwear, underwear, shoes, jewelry, tatoos, make-up, perfume, deodorants, shampoos, hair cuts and hair products; and beauty services, supplies and accessories.
- Entertainment: includes movie and concert tickets; audio and video related items such as stereos, tapes, CD's, speakers (purchased or rented), dating, partying, books and magazines, toys and hobbies, games, trips, sports products and activities; and cigarettes.
- Transportation: includes all taxi and bus fares plus spending on gas for own vehicle using own money.

- Saving: includes money spared intentionally as saving, as well as money which is simply not spent.

Descriptive statistics are used to identify the youth profile while Analysis of Variance is used to test for differences in buying decisions among youths based on their employment status and employment intensity.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The average age of the respondent youth in this study is 17.2 years. Fifty-six percent are males and forty-four percent are females. Average weekly allowance is \$11.30 and average weekly earnings is \$51.68. Sixty-seven percent of these youths come from dual-earner families, nineteen percent from families of single working mothers, and fourteen percent from traditional families where fathers are the only working parent. Seventy-one percent of families are white and twenty-nine percent are non-white. Seventy-two percent of parents has at least a high school or college education. Average family income is \$39,117. Sixty-four percent of youths are employed and thirty-six are unemployed. Of those employed, seventy-three percent worked less than 20 hours a week while twenty-seven percent worked either 20 or more hours a week.

Table 1 shows the relationships between youth employment status and youth purchases of four categories as well as youth saving. Compared to unemployed, employed youths appeared to spend more on food, drinks and snacks and on clothing and personal care items and less on entertainment and transportation. Differences in their savings revealed to be insignificant. Table 2 depicts the relationships between youth employment and their purchases and savings when work intensity is taking into consideration. While employed youths choose to buy more food, drinks and snacks, their purchases in this category appeared to further increase as their hours of work increase. Employment intensity, therefore, reveals a positive impact on food, drinks and snacks expenditures. This may logically be explained by the time spent outside the home which is more likely to be extended for the employed compared to the unemployed. The impact of employment intensity would become negative in the case of the expenditures on clothing and personal care. In comparison between those employed and unemployed youths, purchases of clothing and personal care would be more for the employed, but in the same time working more hours would not result in buying more of the clothing and personal care. On the contrary it would result in buying less of this category of purchases. One possible interpretation of the decline in clothing and personal care purchases as work time increases would be due to the shortage of time versus the surplus of money. Those youths who work more than 20 hours a week while being full time students face a notable lack of leisure time which may further reduce the need for more clothing and personal care items. This interpretation would not hold consistently with the case of entertainment spending. While unemployed youths spend more than the employed on entertainment, it appeared that those who work more than 20 hours a week spend more on entertainment than those who work less than 20 hours a week. An alternative interpretation would be based on the cost of entertainment rather than on the time available for it. Certain items of entertainment such as music and computer supplies and related materials may be afforded by those who earn more due to working more.

Contrary to the expectation, employed youths spend less on transportation than the unemployed. This relation would still be consistent with the case of work intensity. More employed youths spend less on transportation than those who are less employed. When considering work intensity, youth saving is still insignificantly affected by the number of hours youths spend in market work. The findings of this study have implications on marketing and on consumer research. They also have implications for youth education program and public school system. Marketing strategists, parents, educators, counselors, and family practitioners should be aware of the prevalent norms in spending and saving among adolescents which are affected by their employment status and intensity. Mapping the consumption pattern and knowing the spending priorities may help identify the directions of better marketing strategies as well as for more effective consumer education and financial literacy programs for adolescent

Table 1  
Relationship of Youth Employment Status to Youth Purchases

Youth Purchases Employment Status	M	SD	F
Food, Drink and Snacks			
Employed	23.04	27.1	21.6*
Unemployed	17.9	28.3	
Clothing and Personal Care			
Employed	26.9	29.7	15.4*
Unemployed	20.7	30.4	
Entertainment			
Employed	39.4	35.8	17.3*
Unemployed	44.6	30.2	
Transportation			
Employed	0.07	0.84	19.7*
Unemployed	0.10	0.82	
Saving			
Employed	0.03	0.61	1.83
Unemployed	0.08	0.55	

\* $p < .001$

Table 2  
Relationship of Youth Employment Intensity to Youth Purchases

Youth Purchases Employment Status	M	SD	F
<b>Food, Drink and Snacks</b>			
Unemployed	17.9	28.3	12.73*
< 20 hrs/wk	22.9	20.5	
> 20 hrs/wk	23.1	27.7	
<b>Clothing and Personal Care</b>			
Unemployed	20.7	30.4	10.25*
< 20 hrs/wk	27.1	30.2	
> 20 hrs/wk	26.6	29.2	
<b>Entertainment</b>			
Unemployed	44.6	30.2	9.11*
< 20 hrs/wk	39.2	35.6	
> 20 hrs/wk	39.6	36.0	
<b>Transportation</b>			
Unemployed	0.10	0.82	17.47*
< 20 hrs/wk	0.08	0.88	
> 20 hrs/wk	0.06	0.80	
<b>Saving</b>			
Unemployed	0.08	0.55	1.65
< 20 hrs/wk	0.04	0.66	
> 20 hrs/wk	0.03	0.56	

\*p< .001

## REFERENCES

- Alhabeeb, M.J. (1997). The youth market: purchasing power and purchases, *The Proceedings of the Academy of Marketing Studies*, Cullowhee, NC: The Allied Academies, Inc.
- Alhabeeb, M.J. (1996). Teenagers' money, discretionary spending and saving, *Financial Counseling and Planning*, 7, 123-132.
- America's Research Group (1994). The survey says: teenagers want to shop 'til they drop, *Chain Store Age Executive*, November, 91-96.
- Bachman, J.G. (1983). Premature affluence: Do high school students earn too much money? *Economic Outlook USA*, 10, 64-67.

- Bachman, J.G., Johnston, L.D., & O'Malley, P.M. (1981). Smoking, drinking, and drug use among American high school students: Correlates and trends, 1975-1979. *American Journal of Public Health, 58*, 147-166.
- Bachman, J.G., Bare, D.E., & Frankie, E.I. (1986). *Correlates of employment among high school seniors*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan, Institute for Social Research.
- Bachman, J.G. and Schulenberg, J. (1993). How part-time work intensity relate to drug use, problem behavior, time use, and satisfaction among high school seniors: Are these consequences or merely correlates? *Developmental Psychology, 29*, 2, 220-235.
- Bailey, A.W. (1992). Teenagers' employment, earnings, and spending. *Journal of Home Economics*, Summer, 20-24.
- Bills, D.B., Helms, L.B., & Ozcan, M. (1995). The impact of students employment on teachers' attitudes and behaviors toward working students. *Youth and Society, 27*, 2, 169-193.
- Bronfenbrenner, U. (1986). Foreword. In Greenberger and Steinberg, *When teenagers work: The psychological and social costs of adolescent employment*. New York, NY: Basic Books.
- D'Amico, R. (1984). Does employment in high school impair academic progress? *Sociology of Education, 57*, 152-164.
- Douthitt, R.A. (1991). Children's time use in single and two-parent families: Does household organization matter? *Home Economics Research Journal, 20*, 1, 40-51.
- Greenberger, E., & Steinberg, L. (1983). Sex differences in early labor force experience: Harbinger of things to come. *Social Forces, 62*, 2, 467-487.
- Greenberger, E., & Steinberg, L. (1986). *When teenagers work: The psychological and social costs of adolescent employment*. New York, NY: Basic Books, Inc.
- Greenberger, E., Steinberg, L., & Vaux, A. (1980). Adolescents who work: Effects of part-time employment on family and peer relations. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence, 9*, 189-202.
- Greenberger, E., Steinberg, L., & Vaux, A. (1981). Adolescents who work: Health and behavioral consequences of job stress. *Developmental Psychology, 17*, 691-703.
- Guadagno, M.A. (1991). Economic status of two-parent families with employed teens and young adults. *Family Economics Review, 4*, 4, 2-10.
- Guadagno, M.A. (1992). Impact of children's employment on the economic status of two-parent families. *Family Economics Review, 5*, 4, 9-116.
- Hotchkiss, L. (1982). *Effects of work time on school activities and career expectations*. Columbus, OH: National Center for Research in Vocational Education.
- Hotchkiss, L. (1986). Work and Schools: complements or competitors? In K.M. Borman & J. Reisman (Eds), *Becoming a Worker*, 90-115, Norwood, NJ: Ablex.
- Mortimer, J.T., & Finch, M.D. (1986). The effects of part-time work on adolescents' self-concept and achievement. In K.M. Borman & J. Reisman (Eds), *Becoming a Worker*, 66-89, Norwood, NJ: Ablex.
- Mortimer, J.T., & Yamoor, C. (1987). Interrelations and parallels of school and work as sourcespsychological development. *Research in the Sociology of Education and Socialization, 7*, 221-246.
- Mortimer, J.T., Finch, M.D., Owen, T.J., & Shanahan, M. (1990). Gender and work in adolescence, *Youth and Society, 22*, 2, 201-224.

- Mortimer, J.T., Finch, M.D., Shanahan, M. & Ryu, S. (1992). Adolescent work history and behavioral adjustment. *Journal of Research on Adolescence*, 2, 59-80.
- O'Neill, B. (1992). Youth, money, and financial planning. *Journal of Home Economics*, Fall, 12-16.
- Phillips, S., & Sandstrom, K.L. (1990). Parental attitudes toward youth work. *Youth and Society*, 22, 2, 160-183.
- President's Science Advisory Committee (1973). *Youth: Transition to adulthood*, Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Safyer, A., Leahy, B., & Colan N. (1995). The impact of work on adolescent development. *Families in Society*, 76, 38-45.
- Shanahan, M., Finch, M., Mortimer, J., & Ryu, S. (1992). Adolescent work experience and depressive effect. *Social Psychology Quarterly*, 54, 4, 299-317.
- Steinberg, L., Greenberger, E., Garduque, L., Vaux, A., & Ruggiero, M. (1981). Early work experience: Effect on adolescent occupational socialization. *Youth and Society*, 12, 403-422.
- Steinberg, L., Greenberger, E., Garduque, L., McAuliffe, S.(1982). High school students in the labor force: Some costs and benefits to schooling and learning. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 4, 363-372.
- Steinberg, L., Greenberger, E., Garduque, L., Ruggiero, M., & Vaux, A. (1982). Effects of working on adolescent development. *Developmental Psychology*, 18, 385-395.
- Steinberg, L., & Dornbusch, S.M. (1992). Negative correlates of part-time employment during adolescence: Replication and elaboration. *Developmental Psychology*, 27, 304-313.
- Stern, D., McMillion, M., Hopkins, C., & Stone, J.(1990). Work experience for students in high school and college. *Youth and Society*, 21, 3, 355-389.
- St. John, W. (1996). They blow money. *George*, July, 101-129.
- U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (1995). *The Statistical Abstract of the United States*. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Department of Labor.
- U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (1998). *The Statistical Abstract of the United States*. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Department of Labor.
- Williams, N., Cullen, F., & Wright, J. (1996). Labor market participation and youth crime: the neglect of working in delinquency research, *Social Pathology*, 2,3, 195-217.
- Yamoor, C.M., & Mortimer, J.T. (1990). Age and gender differences in the effects of employment on adolescent achievement and well-being. *Youth and Society*, 22, 2, 225-241.
- Zick, C.D., & Allen, C.R. (1996). The impact of parents' marital status on the time adolescents spend in productive activities. *Family Relations*, 45, 65-71.

# MARKETING EDUCATION ON THE INTERNET: CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION

**Edith Hibbert, MPM Graduate: WCU**  
**James W. Pearce, Western Carolina University**  
**pearce@wcu.edu**

## ABSTRACT

*With the advent of advanced technology, the 20th century has been experiencing accelerating change in all areas of development. There is no doubt that this rate of change will increase with added speed in the next millennium. Higher education, is one avenue that has felt the impact of dramatic change, especially in the fields of technology and communication. Changes are seen in both the learning needs and the way learning opportunities are delivered in business, government, and academia arenas.*

*We are fast becoming a society in which continuing education is key to effective participation whether we are citizens, professionals, or wage earners. Concepts, such as on-line learning, interactive learning, just- in- time learning, E-business, Internet commerce, and Web marketing are constantly evolving. Most of these concepts focus on students or clients who wish to learn outside the traditional classroom setting, whether on campus or on the worksite.*

*More than ever before, the Internet has been used as an aid in developing and using interactive, multimedia educational materials. The Web's greatest intrinsic power is that it encourages non-linear instructions and an interaction that is bounded by time and place. On-line education has allowed universities to compete strategically and successfully in attracting undergraduate and graduate students, as well as adult learners who wish or are required by law to receive continued, additional instructions in their chosen fields. Subsequently, in most states of the United States of America, lawyers are required by law to receive continued legal instructions. To adapt to this change in the legal environment, lawyers need to find ways to keep abreast of recent developments in the field while they continue to satisfy the needs of their clients and families.*

*The resulting trend is a paradigm shift from the traditional classroom experience to delivering learning instructions on-line. Therefore, education providers should be cognizant of the fact that there is the need to market their product in a way to get their potential customers unhooked from the conventional way of thinking and learning. Consequently, this paper presents some salient issues that these providers should consider in marketing education on the Internet. It also focuses on the internet as the vehicle for marketing Continuing Legal Education -- the medium that unveils a timely and cost-effective way for lawyers to obtain accreditation for licensure.*

## OVERVIEW

The 20th century has been experiencing dramatic changes due to emerging technologies, materials, equipment, and ways of organizing. These changes have had great impact on how

organizations, whether they are profit or nonprofit organizations, create ways to satisfy needs and wants (of consumers) that have evolved due to these changes. Marketing, is the business function that identifies these unfulfilling needs and wants; determines which target markets the organization can best serve; and decides appropriate products, services, and programs to serve these markets (Kotler, 1997). Kotler further defines the process as a `social and managerial process 'by which individuals and groups obtain what they need and want through creating, offering and exchanging products of value with others.

Effective marketing activities can be conducted under the philosophy of the marketing concept. This concept is a market focused, customer-oriented, coordinated marketing effort aimed at generating customer satisfaction as a key to satisfying organizational goals. Using the marketing concept, organizations do best when they define their target markets carefully, and prepare a tailored marketing program for each target market. The company is required to define customer needs from the customer point of view and not its own.

It is supremely important to satisfy the needs of both new and repeated customers--customer retention is more critical than customer attraction. The key to customer retention is customer satisfaction (Kotler, 1997). If the customer is satisfied he/she will buy again and talk favorably to others about the company and product. The customer will pay less attention to competitor's product offerings and advertising, and purchase other product from the same company. Also, if time is spent on producing quality product, then a ripple effect will be seen in the organization's profits, market share and growth.

More and more organizations in the profit and the non-profit business sectors are recognizing the invaluable contribution that effective marketing makes in improving performance and determining success. As more organizations seek innovative ways to market their product, the web emerges as the most effective of all marketing tools.

#### Marketing on the Web

The Internet is the most dramatic economic phenomenon of the decade. It is a means of exchanging information and communication through a series of interconnected computers. The Economist (Belch & Belch, 1998) points out that no communication medium or electronic technology has ever grown as rapidly. Through its various communication media, it has become the least expensive, yet the most cost effective marketing tool. While the Internet offers a wide range of services to users, the most powerful and popular service is the World Wide Web. For marketers, a number of Internet features offer potential, but it is the Web that has developed as the commercial component. The Web, which is also considered the most user-friendly component, provides a graphical interface worldwide to persons who are connected to the Internet and who have the necessary software installed on their computer. It has become an international marketplace for both tangible and intangible products and services. If you are in the business of marketing, a Web site can be a virtual shop front -- an effective and profitable means to say who you are; and the place where you can advertise your products and/or services to potentially millions of international customers.

Interestingly, most shoppers indicate that convenience is the major driving force for shopping on-line. To support this fact, Louis Harris & Associates conducted a telephone survey for Dell Computer. From a sample population of 1943 computer owners with on-line connectivity, 93 percent stated that on-line shopping affords them the opportunity to shop whenever they want, and from the comfort of their own home. Fifty-eight percent indicated that the options are many when they shop

on-line -- 'they can find anything they want to buy.' Still, another 47 percent reported that they save money when purchasing on-line (The Industry Standard, 1998).

Using the Web, a company can create long term relationships with its customers and prospects through personalized e-mail, welcome messages on web pages, easy access to financial services, and by providing ease in doing transactions, such as filling out application forms, soliciting orders, asking questions and getting the necessary feedback. While there are several other Internet marketing tools (forums, libraries, bulletin boards, e-mail electronic, telephony, and videoconferencing) to reach customers, the Web remains the most advantageous.

#### Advertising on the Web

The Web, like other marketing media, has advertisers, users and potential customers. Most of its advertisers are companies offering computer and other technology products and services. Some companies sell their products directly on the Web, while others sell advertising or sponsorships. Studies show that the number of web users ranged between 23 and 27 million worldwide. The heaviest users are in their 30's and have above-average education and income. They tend to be more technology oriented and are information seekers (Belch & Belch, 1998).

One of the primary objectives of Web marketing is to generate sales directly. However, other objectives include disseminating information about the company's products and/or services, gathering research information, creating awareness, creating company image, and stimulating trials of their offerings. These are best achieved through the use of display banners and the establishment of an interactive web site. Setting up a web site that provides the right information at the right time is the best advertisement a firm can ever offer. Customers and prospects can get information immediately, 24 hours daily, and many find a web site more efficient than responding to individual requests by phone, fax or mail. Many companies are becoming aggressive in their ploy to attract customers to their web site. One of the latest strategies is webcasting, which allows advertisers to push out site information to their users rather than letting them find the site on their own. The best legal sites these are using the push technology to get the firm's name into certain E-mail boxes. This strategy proves to be most beneficial to users for whom time is critical.

A customer is spending time and money when he visits the company's web site, and they want value in return. The theory is that sampling is an effective stimulant to trial purchasing and the sample-use experience will facilitate further purchasing. A valuable promotional strategy is to offer free valuable information, free samples of products and free access to demo versions.

#### The Challenges of Marketing Courses on the Web

Marketing on the Web can be a challenging task, especially when the company's offering is as intangible as knowledge. Many governments, corporations, and various types of social and educational institutions are now aware that the Internet can be the most effective and economical way to deliver high quality training and education to their personnel, clients, and students. For example, Georgia Perimeter College offers three types of distance courses: telecourses offered over cable television or using videotapes; GSAMS (Georgia Statewide Academic and Medical System) courses offered using interactive videoconferencing; and on-line courses offered over the Internet (GPC web page). Western Carolina University now offers on-line courses in Continuing Legal Education and graduate level courses in Project Management (WCU Catalog, 1998-1999).

These implementers have been reaping great benefits in terms of long- run cost effectiveness, and significant savings in time and effort. Claims have been made that the Web can eliminate both

the physical and geographical boundaries of the classroom (Khan, 1997). Students do not have to travel distances to receive learning instructions. Some educators think the Web can augment the learning resources of the institution by the learning resources of the world. In addition, it is said to change the social dynamics of the classroom, foster social interaction, and nullify the authoritarian role of the teacher. While these claims may be true, providers of on-line courses are still left with a few challenges:

How can the institution use the Web to make learning more accessible?

Is the infrastructure adequate for anticipated load in terms of the number of in-coming phone lines, capacity of servers, and bandwidth of internal networks?

How can learning be improved or sustained via the Web?

How can the institution creatively deploy, combine, and employ its resources to facilitate the most cost effective learning package?

What can the institution do to prevent the phobia associated with interacting with technology that may be completely new to the learner?

We cannot deny that marketing courses on the Web can present challenges for both the providers and their customers or prospects. However, these challenges can be addressed in a more practical way if marketers understand the advantages and disadvantages of marketing courses on the Web.

## **THE PROS AND CONS OF MARKETING COURSES ON THE WEB**

### **Advantages**

There are many benefits associated with courses that are offered through the Web: The Web has the ability to reach a large number of participants who are geographically dispersed and who, because of their personal work schedules, or for any other reasons, may not have the opportunity to attend a regular classroom.

The Web increases the richness of communication. It enables greater interactivity between the institution and its clients/customers. It allows thoughts to be captured for future examination, elaboration, and extension.

The Web creates a flow of information from a seller (instructor) to buyer (student), and from students to instructor.

The Web enhances student autonomy and creates a self-paced, environment for learning. All readings are placed on the Web.

It supports time-slipping, that is, students can select the content they wish to receive and when they wish to receive it. They can further choose the content they wish to consume, when, and in what context they wish to consume it.

It changes the social dynamics of education. Everyone (instructor and student) is considered equal. Share of voice is essentially uniform-no participant can drown out others.

The Web provides instant, up-to-date information, which is worldwide in scope, and is presented in a more motivating format for students to explore.

**Disadvantages**

A Web site is an on-going process. Therefore, once a course Web site is operational, costs continue to accrue for the maintenance of this site.

Unlike classroom instruction courses, on-line courses do not provide an immediate feedback mechanism for both instructor and learner. However this can be addressed by using an interactive chat tool to create a virtual office hour for interaction to take place (Khan, 1997).

Some prospects are still concerned about the credibility of on-line courses. A few major concerns are whether the provider can disseminate the right information at the right time; and whether they will get value for their money. This also raises the issue of accreditation. Some are also concerned about the level of technical support that the institution is able to provide.

More time is spent reading and preparing for the course on the Web than for traditional classes.

**Marketing CLE**

Web marketing is clearly a strategy many firms need to employ as they try to adapt to their ever-changing environment. As technology explodes and reshapes the marketplace, continuous training has become mandatory in many fields, and Law is no exception. Approximately 39 states in the US require lawyers to take mandatory continuing legal education (CLE) courses in order to practice law in that particular jurisdiction (ABA Journal, August 1997). Attorneys and jurists must receive additional instructions on a voluntary or compulsory basis through programs administered by public and private agencies and institutions.

For some time now, CLE providers have been exploring ways of enhancing the delivery of their programs to their clients-lawyers. Lawyers who are geographically dispersed, solo practitioners, or operate small firms, find it very difficult to leave their practices to attend a CLE seminar, workshop, or conference.

The Web has revolutionized the use of technology in the legal profession, and most firms are becoming aware of this fact. Consequently, firms are making the best use of technologies, and are providing these lawyers with a remarkably easy way to increase their skills as they satisfy the priorities of client service and family life. Offering CLE on the Web proves to be the single best way of bringing continuing legal education to the homes and offices of lawyers. Through the Web, companies are keeping these lawyers abreast of the latest developments from experts in the field without leaving home. By enrolling in these courses, lawyers can save thousands of travel hours to and from seminars, and keep abreast of legal changes while meeting clients needs.

Of course, the primary objective of putting CLE courses on the Web would be to increase the professional competence of licensed lawyers. As stated in our discussion, building an effective web site is the most attractive marketing strategy for any business to compete on the Web. Consequently, law firms are making these sites more interactive -- more easy-to-use, and marketing experts agree that more interactive sites tend to do better than less interactive ones. The competitive advantage of firms in this market is dependent on the level of interactivity that is created. To increase interaction between instructor and students the primary means of on-line interaction make use of quicker and often less expensive computer technologies (programmed software--hyperlinking and interactive forms, E-mail, mailing lists( listserv), web conferencing, synchronous chat, and simulations). Set up a mailing list for general discussion and announcements, use an anonymous form page as a feedback

mechanism, and employ an interactive chat tool to maintain a virtual office. One unique way of stimulating interaction is by adding a "Be My Guest" book to your site. This bright idea, Mike Spindle (1998) suggests will 'get visitors to sign in, stick around, and come back for more.' Using this tool, users can sign in and volunteer comments and suggestions for your site. This also provides an entertaining, interactive feature that will help you to collect valuable market data and sales leads. The key objectives are to (1) ask the right questions to solicit the right answers; (2) make it as painless as possible for visitors to add themselves to your list.

### **Companies Offering On-line CLE**

CLE On-line is an on-line service company that has developed a web site- 'CLE ONLINE' - to be a common platform, from which all lawyers and other legal professionals can receive continuing legal education (CLE) services in the convenience of their office or home. CLE On-line is the first site on the Internet that is designed to be a central source for lawyers to obtain on-line CLE. Through alliances with other law- related groups, companies and lawyers, CLE is dedicated to producing quality on-line CLE programming in the form of seminars. Its supporting goal is to have a niche of legal professionals take advantage of the powerful and convenient communication tools that the Internet has to offer (<http://cleonline.com>).

### **ABA Center for Continuing Legal Education**

American Bar Association uses technology to make continuing legal education more available to their members. They have endeavored to reach lawyers wherever they practice, and through the Web, have established more ways than ever before to help lawyers learn about the law, and satisfy state's requirement.

ABA offers a wide variety of programs, and products:

ABA Connection--a monthly feature in the ABA Journal combined with a teleconference on a variety of topics.

On-line Seminars--interactive computer discussions and course.

On-line Products--Books and articles sent by e-mail.

LAN (Lawyers Communication Network)--offers the up-to-date information possible about the law and the legal profession through Law in Brief, a daily newspaper program that examines important issues, legislation, court actions and events shaping the practice of law (ABA Journal, August 1998).

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

Successful marketing of CLE courses on the Web, can only be achieved if the following elements are seriously taken into consideration:

1. Convince participants that the course offerings are credible.

Use promotional disk that demonstrates aspects of the course, such as, on-line chats, multimedia-based presentations, and e-mail systems to develop ease of interaction.

Promote the course using the right tools: banner advertisements, search engines that are already established (Yahoo, Alta Vista); and directory sites.

The classic Web marketing strategy is 'give something away, sell something.'

2. Focus on your customer

The most crucial aspect of Web marketing is to get the customer to your site. Most web sites talk about themselves: our product, our company, or service. While this information is good, do not become caught up in it. The more valuable the information you can give your potential client/customer in his/her field, the more likely he/she is to find you on the web search engine. The more helpful the sound, the more likely the client will enter or revisit.

Design your site with the clients in mind (See Conclusion --"What constitute an effective web site for lawyers'").

Develop a FAQ (Frequently Asked Questions) page, which speaks to commonly voiced concerns.

3. Offer Excellent and Quality Products/Services

The countless number of web pages marketing competitors' products/services indicate the need for your company to create a competitive edge by offering excellence in its presentation on the Web. For this there is no substitute. People who surf the Web are usually educated and are information-seekers. They surf to read not to just look at pictures. Presentations should therefore, be logical, and well written.

Provide detailed information instead of skimming the surface with generalities.

Use the ample space available to highlight the benefits the course has to offer; give the clients reasons to participate and to stimulate participation and revisits.

Make the page attractive, to capture attention.

Add sound and pictures, testimonies and prose. Good testimonies, for example, speak well of the company, depict high quality, and portray a sense of reliability.

4. Scan the Web Environment

Constant analysis of your Web site is important. Continuous improvement is the key to its survival. Plan on continuous incremental improvement.

Check to find out which page is the most effective, and which strategy seems to elicit the most response.

Retain those strategies that are working and redefine or eliminate those that are not.

5. Schedule Marketing Time and Money

Set aside time and money to market the course.

Learn the basics of Web page designing, so that minor change can be made without the support professional labor, thus saving time and money.

Always strive to stay one step ahead of obsolescence, keep abreast with technological developments, craft new strategies, and devise new approaches to gain customers, and strategically position the offering in a constantly changing on-line market.

## **CONCLUSION**

### **What Constitutes An Effective Web Site For Lawyers**

Leaving a web site is as easy as clicking the mouse button. As a result, web page designers have focused much of their efforts on identifying what attracts and retains the attention of a visitor. The use of graphics, color, animation, and sound has long been used as external stimuli to motivate learners, and each of these techniques can be applied in some way to accomplish similar purposes on

Web pages. It should be noted, however, that simply adding color, animation, and graphics does not ensure motivating pages. An effective Web site is one that also takes into account the customer's requirements and ease of retrieving the relevant information. These criteria certainly apply to the delivery of education to professionals, especially lawyers. These professionals are task-oriented. They are usually very busy people and need to get things done efficiently -- in the least amount of time possible. Therefore, the following suggestions would be most practical when developing a web site to facilitate their learning:

Make the site accessible, either through an on-line service or Internet service provider. Make sure the service can accommodate the volume and type of traffic you anticipate. Visit an existing site on the provider's server and see how quickly the information is retrieved.

Keep the information retrieval fast. Do not complicate with unnecessary graphics.

Make the territory and scope of the site clear on the pages, to avoid any dissatisfaction. You can create your own content and design.

Have internal procedures to handle the contents to be placed on the site. Keep information as current as possible, with new information and updated links to other valuable sites.

Providing links to other legal sites is important, but it is best to mirror the content of these sites. Thus, instead of linking to another web site, gain permission to copy that document to your own site. Some are using frames so that a user clicking on or off site links never actually leaves; the linked site appears in a window at the firm's site.

This list of suggestions is certainly not exhaustive. Organizations are taking a variety of approaches to making their Web site attractive and interactive. Remember your site can attract a broad audience, some of whom are never likely to purchase or use your product. But, they could influence perceptions of the company and certainly increase word-of-mouth communication, which could filter through to significant real customers.

CLE providers need to join the bandwagon to compete in the on-line education delivery market. Without a shadow of a doubt, the World Wide Web is the most popular Internet service and the most important service for the professional Internet user. Clearly, it is incumbent on these providers in their effort to market CLE on-line, to satisfy the basic needs of these lawyers:

- communicate with their peers;
- keep abreast of recent developments in the law;
- have easier access to relevant information and documents;
- conduct legal research;
- market their services; and
- recruit talents.

Success in satisfying these needs will serve as a vital promotional tool and provide a 'springboard' for their effort in marketing CLE on-line.

## **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

1. American Bar Association Journal, August 1998
2. Belch, George E. & Belch, Michael A. (1998) Advertising and Promotion: An Integrated Marketing Communications Perspective. 4th Ed. New York, NY:

3. CLE On-line Web Site-( <http://www.cleonline.com>).
4. Georgia Perimeter College (GPC) Distance Learning Student Success Guide--(<http://www.gpc.peachnet.edu/~pgore/distanceed/studenthandbook.php>).
5. Khan, B. H. (1997) Web-based Instruction. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Educational Technology.
6. Kotler, Philip (1997). Marketing Management: Analysis, Planning, Implementation and Control. 9th Ed. Upper Saddle, NJ: Prentice Hall.
7. Spindle, Mike (1998) Be My Guest. Home Office Computing Journal, October 1998.
8. The Industry Standard, Nov. 30--Dec. 7, 1998 (<http://www.thestandard.com>).
9. Western Carolina University Catalog- (<http://www.wcu.edu>)

# THE ESSENTIAL FERDINAND de SAUSSURE: PARADIGMATIC AND SYNTAGMATIC DIMENSIONS OF VISUAL RHETORIC

Val Larsen, Truman State University  
vlarsen@truman.edu

Neil D. Gilchrist, Truman State University  
ndg@truman.edu

Newell D. Wright, James Madison University  
wrightnd@jmu.edu

## ABSTRACT

*This article argues that, though it has proven value in many social domains, the work of Ferdinand de Saussure may be most productively applied to the kind of micro phenomena that were the focus of Saussure's own work. In close readings of the visual rhetoric in two automobile advertisements, the article suggests that ad claims may be more persuasive when they are asserted tacitly in the paradigmatic or syntagmatic structure of the ad than when they are asserted directly.*

## INTRODUCTION

Since it is the wellspring of several highly influential and yet quite distinctive schools of academic thought--post-structuralism, deconstructionism, semiotics--Ferdinand de Saussure's (1983 [1915]) *Course in General Linguistics* is destined to rank as one of the most influential books published in the twentieth century. As Roy Harris (1983) has observed, "With the sole exception of Wittgenstein, no thinker has had as profound an influence on the modern view of *homo loquens* as Saussure." In marketing, Saussure's influence is most massively apparent in *Marketing and Semiotics: New Directions in the Study of Signs for Sale* (Umiker-Sebeok 1987), a collection of essays from a veritable *Who's Who* of interpretive marketing researchers. But while it is clear that Saussure has significantly influenced marketing research, his influence has, for the most part, not been direct. It has been refracted through the work of scholars like Claude Levi-Strauss and Umberto Eco who have applied Saussure's key insights in fields such as anthropology and cultural studies that are more expansive, less nomothetic, than linguistics, Saussure's own discipline. Saussure's ideas have proven fruitful in domains very different from the one in which they were originally generated because they map basic structures of human consciousness that are fundamentally linguistic. But valuable as these larger scale anthropological and semiotic applications may be, the most fruitful applications of Saussurian thought to marketing are likely to be those that adhere most closely to the linguistic roots of his mode of inquiry. Yet, with the partial exception of Kehret-Ward (1987) and Durand (1987), this relatively direct application of Saussure's ideas has not occurred in marketing: previous marketing researchers have shown that Saussure's ideas can illuminate macro phenomena;

they have not explored the application of his insights to the kind of micro phenomena that were the focus of his own work. In this article, we introduce some of Saussure's key concepts within their original linguistic framework, then, in a close reading of two automobile advertisements, apply them to phenomena only a step removed from the concreteness of linguistics.

### KEY SAUSSURIAN CONCEPTS

The overall thrust of Saussure's work was to break language down into its constituent parts, the elements and relations that make meaning possible. In this brief account of his thought, we will treat three kinds of relations among signs--paradigmatic, syntagmatic, and semantic relations.

**Paradigmatic Relations:** Linguistic elements (sounds, words) have a paradigmatic relationship to each other when they are substitutable one for another. For instance, the nearly identical sounds signified by *b* and *p* are paradigmatically related because they are substitutable. These two sounds differ mainly in that *b* is voiced (we vibrate the vocal chord while making the sound) whereas *p* is unvoiced. Small as it is, this voiced/unvoiced difference is functional in English: it is what differentiates the word *bat* from the word *pat*. Other sounds are also paradigmatically related to *p* and *b*, for example, *c*, *f*, and *h*, which form the words *cat*, *fat*, and *hat* when they replace their paradigmatic counterparts. And what is true of sounds is also true of words. For instance, the words *a*, *the*, *this*, *that*, *each*, and *any* are paradigmatically related. All are determiners that produce a well formed expression if they fill in, paradigmatically, the blank in the following sentence: \_\_\_\_\_ *sentence can be understood*. Other words--*running*, *apple*, *to*--are not paradigmatically related to the determiners, for they are not acceptable substitutes for the missing element in the sentence. If these words are put into the blank, the sentence becomes ill formed.

**Syntagmatic Relations:** When several words are combined to form a larger whole (a sentence), sequencing issues arise. A given set of words may be combined in ways that create both well formed (*this sentence can be understood*) and ill formed expressions (*be this can sentence understood*). Acceptable syntagmatic relationships are specified by grammatical rules that prescribe the proper sequencing of sentence elements: determiners (*this*) precede nouns (*sentence*) and, in a verb phrase, the modal (*can*) precedes the auxiliary (*be*) which, in turn, precedes the main verb (*understood*). When the words are not sequenced as prescribed by grammatical rules, the sentence is meaningless.

**Semantic Relations:** It is possible for a sentence to be unintelligible even though it is paradigmatically and syntagmatically well formed. Consider the following sentence: *This shoe eats love*. The determiner, nouns, and verb are all in their proper slots, so the sentence is grammatically intelligible. But it is, nevertheless, an ill formed, meaningless sentence. The problem in this case is semantic, a matter of compatible meanings. When used literally, the verb *eat* must be paired with an animate subject and a tangible object. In this sentence, neither of these conditions holds. Even read poetically (a kind of reading where semantic rules are relaxed and suggestive ambiguity is valued), it is hard to see what this sentence might mean. Semantic compatibility, meaning compatibility, is much more complex and less well understood than paradigmatic and syntagmatic compatibility. Nevertheless, building on Saussure's work, Chafe (1970) has argued convincingly that a word derives its meaning from bundles of semantic elements (*animate*, *human*, *potent*) that, taken together,

constitute its meaning. Only words which share crucial semantic components can be combined to form intelligible utterances.

### AD ANALYSIS

Application to a Mercedes Benz Ad: All three of Saussure's key concepts come into play in the six-page Mercedes Benz ad that is described in Table 1. Each page of the ad, except the last, features a black and white photograph of a famous movie star standing next to his or her Mercedes. Beneath the picture is a brief caption that links the star to the car. The last page features a fold-out, black-and-white picture of the new E-Class Mercedes, a caption, and six brief paragraphs that extol the styling, safety features, security system, roominess, and engine of the new model and tell how one can learn more about it. While the ad uses both the central and peripheral paths to persuasion (Petty, Cacioppo, and Schumann 1983), the peripheral argument is most important, for the most striking aspect of this ad is not the explicitly rational rhetoric of the six feature-oriented paragraphs on the last page, it is the visual rhetoric embodied in the sequence of pictures, with their accompanying captions. The clarity and force of that visual rhetoric flows from the use of simple paradigmatic, syntagmatic, and semantic structures.

Table 1

STAR	CAR	TEXT
Marlene Dietrich	200 Stuttgart Cabrio C	This sultry starlet held a torch for a 200 Stuttgart Cabrio C, a car with which she'd find herself falling in love again. And again. And again.
Errol Flynn	300 S Cabriolet	This 1930's swashbuckler is pictured here entering a Mercedes 300 S Cabriolet. Could this be what coined the phrase "In like Flynn"?
Bing Crosby	Unnamed Model	It's no wonder Bing made so many road movies. You'd expect no less. After all, he was inspired by this jazzy Mercedes B-B-B-Benz.
Gary Cooper	300 Coupe	The "Coop" is seen here posing with a Mercedes 300 coupe. The year? 1955. The time of day? High noon, of course. Yup.
Yul Brynner	300d	The shine on this, perhaps the most celebrated of Hollywood domes, was rivaled only by the shine on the hood of this Mercedes 300d.
_____	E-Class	Introducing the next generation E-class. Six paragraphs on the car's style, safety features, security system, roominess, engine, and how to learn more.

The semantic relationships in the ad are apparent in a horizontal reading of Table 1. The star and the car are compatible with each other because they embody many of the same underlying cultural meanings: glamour, wealth, social status. A Ford, Dodge, or Toyota would be no more consistent with these stars than an inanimate noun would be with an animate verb. Were these other makes included in the photographs rather than a Mercedes, the images would be semantically ill formed.

The captions strengthen the semantic link between the star and the car by invoking distinguishing characteristics of the stars and explicitly tying them to the car. The modern love goddess Marlene Dietrich found herself falling in love with her Mercedes again and again. Errol Flynn was so well known and so intimately linked to his Mercedes, the caption suggests tongue-in-cheek, that the relationship gave rise to the cliché "In like Flynn." Bing Crosby is linked to his Mercedes by his roles both as a film star (the road movies) and as a popular singer (B-B-B-Benz). Likewise, Gary Cooper is linked to his Mercedes both through his nickname (Coop/coupe) and through an allusion to his best known movie (*High Noon*). Yul Brynner was linked to his Mercedes by his most striking physical feature, his shiny bald head. In each photograph--except that of Yul Brynner--the camera angle also links the star and car by positioning the well-known Mercedes hood ornament next to the star's right shoulder. In each instance, the ad makes its point primarily through the visual connection between the star and car, merely reinforcing the pictorial argument in the caption.

The syntactic relationships in the ad are apparent in a vertical reading of Table 1. The order of the photographs in this ad is governed by a single syntactical rule--maintaining a normal temporal chronology. In other words, the photographs are sequenced from earlier to later stars (Dietrich, Flynn, Crosby, Cooper, Brynner) and from earlier to later Mercedes models (200 Stuttgart to E300). The temporal sequence is marked either visually by the style of the car or verbally by an explicit mention of the date in the caption. Thus, we see most or all of the 200 Stuttgart, the 300d, and the contemporary E300, each of which can be situated temporally by its styling. In the other three pictures, we see mainly the front grill of the car; consequently, it is harder to situate the automobile temporally. But for two of these three photographs, the caption mentions a date (1930s, 1955).

The chronological sequencing of the photographs is an important part of the ad's message since the successive generations of film stars invoke the sense of heritage that upper class consumers tend to value (Coleman 1983). Once again, that implicit message is reinforced by a caption, in this case the culminating caption that accompanies the final photograph: "Introducing the next generation E-Class." By purchasing a Mercedes, the sequence suggests, the reader can position him or herself as the culmination of the series, as the inheritor of the social meanings embodied by the great actors.

The paradigmatic relationships in the ad are also apparent in a vertical reading of Table 1. However, in a paradigmatic analysis, we focus not on sequence but on category creation and membership. How are these paradigmatic categories created? The first page of this ad features three elements, Marlene Dietrich, a 200 Stuttgart Cabrio C, and a saying that describes the relationship between Dietrich and her car. At this point, each of these elements is a particular. But on the second page, the situation begins to change. None of the three particulars on the first page shows up on the second; however, the three elements that are featured--Errol Flynn, a 300S Cabriolet, and a reflection on the relationship between Flynn and his car--are obviously similar to the three elements on the first page. Those similarities create three categories--the star, the car, and the caption. And those three categories begin to constitute a formal structure that is separable from any particular elements that

manifest it. On the three succeeding pages, repetition makes the formal structure still more salient. The particular persons are now paradigmatically related place holders that fill the *star* slot. Likewise, the particular Mercedes models and comments have become paradigmatic placeholders in the *car* and *caption* slots.

From the establishment of this salient tripartite form flows the central claim of the ad: the reader can become a glamorous, high status, socially successful star like those pictured in the previous photographs if he or she purchases an M-Class Mercedes and, thereby, fills the empty star slot in the last photograph. Explicitly stated as in the previous sentence, this claim is implausible on its face and is sure to be rejected in the era of the schemer schema (Wright 1986). But stated tacitly in the very form of the ad, it may have persuasive force. Counter argumentation is, presumably, much less likely when the ad claim is tacit but, nevertheless, perfectly clear given a moment's reflection on form. Of course, most readers of the ad will not think about its form any more than they think about the grammar of the sentences they use. But they will, nevertheless, understand its implicit claim just as they understand sentences that are paradigmatically, syntagmatically, and semantically structured.

Application to a Nissan 240SX Ad: The story board of the Nissan television commercial that will be discussed next has been published in the second and third editions of Michael Solomon's (1996) *Consumer Behavior*. The images and dialog are described in Table 2.

Table 2

PICTURE	DIALOGUE
A red Nissan 240SX on a flat plain.	If I had a Nissan 240SX . . . it would be a red coupe.
A silver 240SX on the same flat plain.	Wait! A silver fastback. And I'd go for a spin up Route 7, the twisty part.
A Dalmatian dog sitting in the passenger's seat as viewed from the driver's seat.	Just me and Astro . . .
A casually dressed young woman sitting in the passenger's seat looking at the driver, again viewed from the driver's seat.	no, Amy.
Christie Brinkley sitting in the passenger's seat, dressed in a black and white polka dot outfit, posed seductively and looking at the driver, again viewed from the driver's seat.	Heck, Christie Brinkley!
A stretch of road heading off into the distance on a flat plain.	Wow! Yeah, me and Christie . . .
A red 240SX viewed at a distance on a twisty country road.	in my silver--no red 240SX . . . driving into the sunset.

As in the Mercedes ad, the central argument in this commercial is made tacitly within the ad's structure. But here, the structure is somewhat more complex. Once again, the ad is largely organized by three paradigmatic categories, in this case, the car, the color, and the companion. The elements that fit within each category are listed in Table 3.

Table 3

CAR	COLOR	COMPANION
Nissan 240SX	Red	Astro
	Silver	Amy
		Christie Brinkley

The key to the structural argument in this ad is the fact that items in the three main categories are subject to different degrees and kinds of paradigmatic and syntagmatic variation. Specifically, the companion category differs from the car and color categories in that it is organized by both paradigmatic and syntagmatic principles and is subject to a higher degree of variation.

The paradigmatic relationship between Astro, Amy, and Christie Brinkley is signified by both verbal and visual cues. The dialogue makes the substitutional relationship between the three elements explicit: "Just me and Astro . . . no, Amy. Heck, Christie Brinkley!" Visual cues reinforce the point. The perspective and background of the shots showing Astro, Amy, and Christie Brinkley are identical. Moreover, Christie Brinkley's black and white polka dot outfit links her to the Dalmatian dog Astro. But though they are all companions, these three ad elements also differ in ways that make them susceptible to syntagmatic sequencing. They differ in being more and less desirable companions. They are sequenced by a syntagmatic rule that requires the less desirable to precede the more desirable companion. This sequencing is consistent with the expanding-fantasy theme that runs through the ad.

Within the other two paradigmatic categories, color and car, there is less substitution and no syntagmatic sequencing. The first two shots in the ad set up a paradigmatic relationship between the colors red and silver and between the coupe and fastback models of the 240SX. The principle of paradigmatic substitution that is so crucial to the argument of the ad is highlighted by the fact that the cars of alternative colors/models are shown against an identical, barren background. The background has no intrinsic interest and the only thing that changes from one shot to the next is the color/model, so substitution, which is further highlighted in the voiceover dialogue, becomes the central motif of the ad. But also crucial to the argument of the ad is the fact that the narrator moves back and forth over the course of the commercial between red and silver in a way that suggests there is no consequential difference between these options. In other words, there is no syntagmatic principle that can order these color preferences on some meaningful dimension. And what is true of color is still more true of the car. While the narrator does equivocate (again inconsequentially) between the coupe and the fastback, he doesn't deviate in his devotion to the 240SX. The car category has only one member, the Nissan 240SX.

The implicit argument of the ad emerges in the contrast between the kind of substitution that occurs in the companion and car categories. Since this is a fantasy, there is no cost to augmenting one's ideal vision by substituting more desirable objects for those that are less desirable. The speaker acts on this fact by moving up to the most desirable companion he can think of, Christie Brinkley, a woman who is clearly out of his league. In the car category, on the other hand, he doesn't budge from his original commitment to the Nissan 240SX. Implicit in this fact is the claim that the 240SX is the ultimate car. As in the case of the Mercedes, this claim would likely be implausible on its face if it were explicitly stated. But asserted tacitly through the structure of the ad, it may evoke no counterargument and be persuasive.

### CONCLUSION

The main argument of this paper is that Ferdinand de Saussure's work, which has been so fruitfully applied to macro phenomena, may be even more fruitfully applied to micro phenomena that more closely resemble the communications which were the focus of his own work. Applying Saussurian concepts to marketing communications, in particular, advertising, may reveal the ways in which formal structures communicate tacit but nevertheless clear arguments that are not subject to counterargumentation. These ad claims are clear because they are rooted in the paradigmatic and syntagmatic relationships that fundamentally structure thought. They are tacit in that they are expressed formally rather than verbally.

### REFERENCES

- Chafe, W. L. (1970). *Meaning and the Structure of Language*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Coleman, R. P. (1983). The Continuing Significance of Social Class to Marketing. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 10(December), 265-280.
- Durand, J. (1987). Rhetorical Figures in the Advertising Image. In J. Umiker-Sebeok (Ed.), *Marketing and Semiotics: New Directions in the Study of Signs for Sale*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Harris, R. (1983). Translator's Introduction. *Course in General Linguistics* by Ferdinand de Saussure. La Salle, Illinois: Open Court, p. ix.
- Kehret-Ward, T. (1987). Combining Products in Use: How the Syntax of Product Use Affects Marketing Decisions. In J. Umiker-Sebeok (Ed.), *Marketing and Semiotics: New Directions in the Study of Signs for Sale*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Petty, R. E., Cacioppo, J. T., & Schumann, D. (1983). Central and Peripheral Routes to Advertising Effectiveness: The Moderating Role of Involvement. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 10 (June), 135-46.

de Saussure, F. (1983). *Course in General Linguistics*. La Salle, Illinois: Open Court. (Original work published 1915)

Solomon, M. R. (1996). *Consumer Behavior* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed., p. 229). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.

Umiker-Sebeok, J. (Ed.). (1987). *Marketing and Semiotics: New Directions in the Study of Signs for Sale*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.

Wright, P. (1986). Schemer Schema: Consumers' Intuitive Theories About Marketers' Influence Tactics. *Advances in Consumer Research*. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research, 1-3.

# **MATERIALISM AND VALUE JUDGMENTS: FOUR PERSPECTIVES**

**Val Larsen, Truman State University  
VLARSEN@truman.edu**

**M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University  
sirgy@vt.edu**

**Newell D. Wright, James Madison University  
wrightnd@jmu.edu**

## **ABSTRACT**

*Building upon a conceptual framework proposed by Belk and in the context of an extensive literature review, we discuss the antecedents (innate/learned) and consequences (bad/good) of materialism.*

## **INTRODUCTION**

What is materialism? In common usage, this word refers to the belief that material objects are important and valuable. Thus, a materialistic person is someone who values material objects highly and, shifting from a psychological to a sociological perspective, a materialistic culture is one in which most people value material objects highly. This is a neutral definition of the word's core meaning. But the word generally has a secondary meaning as well, an implicit -- usually negative -- value judgment. Thus, when people are described as being materialistic, they are usually held to have an inordinate preoccupation with material things to the exclusion of more important spiritual or intellectual concerns. In this article, we set aside these negative, value-judgment connotations of the term and, thus, leave open the possibility that materialism may have positive as well as negative consequences. As we use the term, then, materialism merely denotes the degree to which individuals or groups value material possessions. People exhibit high materialism if material possessions are important to them, low materialism if material possessions are unimportant.

While materialism does seem to be increasing and while critics often hold marketers responsible for this, in their view, unfortunate increase (Lasch 1979), there is not a great deal of empirical work that examines the antecedents and consequences of materialism. This paper reviews available evidence on possible antecedents and consequences and suggests research propositions which might be investigated in future research.

## **FOUR PERSPECTIVES ON MATERIALISM**

Despite calls for the development of such a theory (Solomon 1983), no comprehensive theory of materialism yet exists. Consequently, this paper will be organized not by an integrated theory but by conceptual framework, a modified and expanded version of a 2 x 2 matrix proposed by Belk

(1983). As Figure 1 illustrates, this matrix is based on a broad classification of materialism's antecedents (innate/learned) and two alternative value judgments about its consequences (good/bad).

	<b>INNATE</b>	<b>LEARNED</b>
<b>GOOD</b>	Epicurean Perspective	Bourgeois Perspective
<b>BAD</b>	Religious Perspective	Critical Perspective

**Figure 1**

This first section of the paper discusses one or more thinkers located in each cell of Belk's matrix. The second major section discusses scales that have been developed to measure materialism, scales which generally reflect the perspective of one of the matrix cells. The third major section examines antecedents of materialism, initially treating possible innate causes of materialism, then discussing external factors that may result in a learned predisposition to be materialistic. The fourth major section discusses negative and positive consequences of materialism.

### **Innate and Good**

In the first cell, materialism is held to be innate and good. Human beings are born with a desire for material possessions, and those possessions produce pleasures which are their own justification. Thus, hedonism is a reasonable and salutary lifestyle. The value system implicit here is relatively simple. It represents a kind of pre-critical natural attitude.

This point of view, sometimes called Epicureanism, was articulated by the ancient Greek philosopher Epicurus, who distrusted abstract reasoning, believing that nothing was more real than the immediate sensations of pleasure and pain (Copleston 1965). Epicurus demonstrated that adopting a hedonistic perspective need not imply a life of crude animalism. Wise hedonists understand that certain actions and possessions may give short-term pleasure but long-term pain. They manage their lives in such a way as to maximize pleasure and minimize pain. To the extent that material possessions produce more pleasure than pain, they should be sought and enjoyed.

### **Innate and Bad**

In the second cell, materialism is held to be innate and bad. Human beings are viewed as being born inherently corrupt or fallen, imbued with an unreasonable and unholy desire to amass things. Left to their own materialist impulses, they will wallow in at least four of the seven deadly sins: greed, envy, gluttony, and pride. As this catalog of sins suggests, this view has been most prominently embodied in religion, and it probably represents an ancient critical response to the natural attitude represented in the first cell. Though religions -- as we shall see -- differ greatly in their attitude toward materialism, most seek to moderate material desires in the name of a higher spiritual reality. Most call upon adherents to wholly or partly transcend the desire for material things by means of divine grace, meditation, or ascetic renunciation. Attention is thus turned from the distraction of material things to the real business of the soul -- the quest for salvation.

In Christianity, this view is articulated in Jesus's parable of the rich man and Lazarus (Luke 16: 19-31) and in St. Paul's spirit/body dualism (Romans 7: 14-25). In Hinduism, it is articulated by Upanishadic seers who claim that salvation is best attained by freeing the soul from the tyranny of things (Noss 1969, p. 97). In Buddhism, it is represented in the Buddha's great renunciation of his

princely life (Hesse 1951, Noss 1969). Pushed to its logical extreme, the lifestyle implied by this cell is the ascetic life of a monk or wandering holy man. Though it remains important, in the United States the influence of this perspective diminished greatly between 1880 and 1930, giving way to the perspective typical of the next cell (Leach 1993; Lears 1983).

### **Acquired and Good**

In cell three, materialism is viewed as being acquired and good. Though people are not born with a desire for and a capacity to create wealth, they should be taught to desire comfort for themselves and accompanying prosperity for the larger society. Social progress results when people want a nice home, several cars, a good education for their children, an ample investment portfolio, and are taught how to attain these things.

This cell represents the middle class or bourgeoisie point of view (Gay 1984; LaWita 1994; Lippman 1943). It has been articulated by spokespersons such as George Guilder (1981) and George Will (1991), who argue that consumption contributes to fulfillment. But while especially characteristic of free market conservatives like Guilder and Will, it tends to be the pre-critical attitude of Americans across the political spectrum. As we shall see, this perspective was implicit in the work of Mochis and other consumer behavior researchers who first undertook the empirical study of materialism in marketing.

### **Acquired and Bad**

In cell four, materialism is viewed as being acquired and bad. Human beings are not born with a tasteless and unreflective lust for material abundance, for some individuals and groups have sought to be part of nature rather than its master. To preserve itself, consumer capitalism must foster in people the unnatural and false belief that happiness flows from a superabundance of possessions. This belief is bad both because it is false and because the lifestyle it leads to is environmentally unsustainable. Modern middle class consumers are blinded by a kind of "false consciousness," a set of illusions which lead them to believe they are expressing themselves and meeting their own needs when, in reality, they are pawns of a social system that consumes them.

Spokespersons for this point of view include the more deeply critical environmentalists -- Paul Ehrlich (Ehrlich, Ehrlich, and Holdren 1977), Dave Foreman (1987) -- and neo-Marxist critical theorists like Jürgen Habermas (1973). It has been articulated in marketing by exponents of critical theory (Murray and Ozanne 1992) and by self-described radicals (Kilbourne 1987). In research focused specifically on materialism, this perspective is reflected quite clearly in the work of Belk (1983, 1984, 1985, 1987a, 1987b) and Pollay (1986), somewhat less clearly in the work of Richins and Dawson (1990, 1992).

## FULL PAPER

In the full version of this paper, we build upon this matrix by examining the antecedents and consequences of materialism. In discussing antecedents, we propose that innate materialism may be affected by gender and age. Moving from aggregate to individual factors, we propose that acquired materialism may be rooted in social structure, religion, politics, advertising, Diderot effects, socio-economic status, childhood socialization, role commitment and insecurity, and locus of control. Moving from individual to aggregate factors, we propose that negative consequences of materialism may include life dissatisfaction, decreased self-esteem, social alienation, possessiveness, shoplifting, family contentiousness, and environmental degradation. Positive consequences may include enhanced self-esteem, the staffing of socially valued occupations, wealth creation, a more equal income distribution, and protection of the environment. We also discuss current measures of materialism and suggest that they are insufficiently reliable and valid.

## REFERENCES

- Belk, Russell W. (1983), "Worldly Possessions: Issues and Criticisms," in *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol 10, eds. Richard P. Bagozzi and Alice M. Tybout, Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research, 514-519.
- (1984), "Three Scales to Measure Constructs Related to Materialism: Reliability, Validity and Relationships to Measures of Happiness," in *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 11, ed. Thomas F. Kinnear, Ann Arbor MI: Association for Consumer Research, 291-297.
- (1985), "Materialism: Trait Aspects of Living in the Material World," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 12 (December), 265-280.
- (1987a), "Material Values in the Comics," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 14 (June), 26-42.
- (1987b), "A Child's Christmas in America: Santa Claus as Deity, Consumption as Religion," *Journal of American Culture*, 10 (Spring), 87-100.
- Copleston, Frederick (1965), *Modern Philosophy: Fichte to Hegel*, New York: Image Books.
- Ehrlich, Paul, Anne H. Ehrlich, and John P. Holdren (1977), *Ecoscience: Population, Resources, Environment*, San Francisco: Freeman.
- Foreman, Dave (1987), *Ecodefense: A Field Guide to Monkeywrenching*, Tucson, AZ: Ned Ludd Books.
- Gay, Peter (1984), *The Bourgeois Experience*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Guilder, George (1981), *Wealth and Poverty*, New York: Bantam.
- Habermans, Jürgen (1973), *Theory and Practice*, Boston: Beacon.
- Hesse, Hermann (1951), *Siddhartha*, New York: New Directions.
- Kilbourne, William E. (1987), "Self-Actualization and the Consumption Process: Can You Get There from Here?" *Philosophical and Radical Thought in Marketing*, ed. A. Fuat Firat, Nikhilesh Dholakia, and Richard P. Bagozzi, Lexington, MA: Lexington Books, 217-234.
- Lasch, Christopher (1979), *The Culture of Narcissism: American Life in an Age of Diminishing Expectations*, New York: W. W. Norton and Company.
- LaWitta, Beatrix (1994), *French Bourgeois Culture*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Leach, William (1993), *Land of Desire*, New York: Random House.

- Lears, T. J. Jackson (1983), "From Salvation to Self Realization: Advertising and the Therapeutic Roots of the Consumer Culture, 1880-1930," *The Culture of Consumption: Critical Essays in American History, 1880-1980*, eds. Richard W. Fox and T. J. Jackson Lears, New York: Parthese Books, 3-38.
- Lippman, Walter (1943), *The Good Society*, Boston: Little, Brown & Company.
- Murray, Jeff B. and Julie L. Ozanne, (1991), "The Critical Imagination: Emancipatory Interests in Consumer Research," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 18 (September), 129-144.
- Noss, John B. (1969), *Man's Religions*, New York: Macmillan.
- Pollay, Richard (1986), "The Distorted Mirror: Reflections on the Unintended Consequences of Advertising," *Journal of Marketing*, 50 (April), 18-36.
- Richins, Marsha L. and Scott Dawson (1990), "Measuring Material Values: A Preliminary Report of Scale Development," in *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 17, eds. Marvin E. Goldberg, Gerald Gorn, and Richard W. Pollay, Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research, 169-175.
- and ----- (1992), "A Consumer Values Orientation for Materialism and Its Measurement: Scale Development and Validation," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 19 (December), 303-316.
- Solomon, Michael (1983), "The Role of Products as Social Stimuli: A Symbolic Interactionist Perspective," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 10 (December), 319-329.
- Will, George F. (1991), "Selling America: Consumer Culture Defended," *Roanoke Times & World News*, April 29.

# **AD POD EFFECTS IN TV ADVERTISING: ORDER, ADJACENCY, AND INFORMATIONAL\EMOTIONAL APPEAL**

**Stacey Manning, Truman State University  
Val Larsen, Truman State University**

## **ABSTRACT**

*This study examines context effects on the recall and recognition of ads and on attitudes toward brands. The study focuses, in particular, on the ad pod as a context for the ad. Within an ad pod context, it examines the effects of serial position (primacy, recency), the nature of adjacent ads, and informational versus emotional appeals.*

## **INTRODUCTION**

The effects of various contexts on responses to advertising, especially television advertising, have received considerable attention from researchers. The relationship between programs and the emotions they evoke on the one hand and ad responses on the other has been especially well studied. For example, Goldberg and Gorn (1987) have explored the effect of happy and sad TV programs on reactions to commercials. They found that a happy program produced a more positive mood as viewers watched commercials, greater perceived commercial effectiveness, more affectively positive cognitive responses, and to some extent, better recall. Studying the power of feelings in understanding advertising effects, Edell and Burke (1987) also found that antecedent negative and positive feelings are an important predictor of ad effectiveness and that these feelings significantly influence beliefs about brand attributes and attitudes toward the brand.

However, important as the programs in which an ad is embedded and the feelings they evoke may be to ad effectiveness, other aspects of context may be still more important. The immediate context for most television commercials is not the television program in which it is embedded but rather, other, adjacent commercials also included in the pod of ads. Precisely what precedes and follows an ad is also, of course, a function of an ad's position within the pod of ads, so pod position effects are another potentially important aspect of ad context. Our objective in this study was to explore these more immediate context effects.

## **PRIMACY AND RECENCY EFFECTS**

Two recently published studies on ad pod position effects have provided some support for the idea that serial position within an ad pod may drive ad responses. Testing the applicability of the large body of psychological research on primacy and recency (e.g., Kerr, Ward, and Avons, 1998), Zhao (1997) found that advertisements fared "better...in an earlier position within the pod." Two other researchers, Pieters & Bijmolt (1997), found that "primacy and recency have only modest effect

sizes [and that] placing a commercial first is better than placing it last." Important as these studies are in giving an idea of the effects that advertisers can expect from various serial positions in an ad pod, each has important limitations. Zhao's study was a quasi-experiment conducted in the aftermath of the Super Bowl. While the study has good external validity, its internal validity is questionable. Zhao was unable, for instance, to control for effects of different brand names and of various executional variables. Since all subjects saw the same set of ads in the same positions within the pod, the effects of order were confounded with execution and brand effects. And Super Bowl ads being notorious for their clever writing, stylistic innovation, and high production values, Zhao's sample of ads cannot be seen as representative of ordinary advertising. The Pieters and Bijmolt (1997) study was conducted in The Netherlands where ads occur only between programs and where the average pod is much longer than it is in the United States. Thus, the blocks of commercials they used in their study averaged 12.7 minutes in length. Findings on ad pods of that length may well be inapplicable to the much shorter ad pods typical in the United States, especially since American ad pods are generally much more embedded within television programs. In this study, ad pods were more representative of those typical in the United States, both in their length (6 minutes) and in being embedded in segments of a program. In addition, the data were collected in an experiment rather than a quasi-experiment, so internal validity should be higher than it was in Zhao's study.

### **INFORMATIONAL/TRANSFORMATIONAL AD EFFECTS**

In an important article, Puto and Wells (1983) distinguished some years ago between two broad classes of ads: those that are transformational (primarily emotive in their appeal) and those that are informational (primarily rational in their appeal). Subsequent researchers have found that ads in the two classes have quite different effects on viewers. Hitchon and Thorson (1995), for instance, found that ads with a high emotional content (transformational ads) wear out over multiple exposures more slowly than those with a low emotional content (informational ads). In a more elaborate study that built upon this distinction between cognitive and affective ads, Singh and Cole (1993) found that informational ads produce higher ad claim recall than transformational ads across 0, 4, and 8 repetitions but lower brand name recall. Moreover, liking for the commercial increased as the length of the commercial increased from 15 to 30 seconds if the ad were transformational but decreased if the ad were informational. While these studies make it clear that the distinction between informational and transformational advertising should be of interest to advertising theorists and practitioners and that the two kinds of ads have different effects, they do not look at the context effects of these two classes of ads. In our study, we explored these context effects.

### **HYPOTHESES**

The issues treated in this study are encapsulated in three sets of hypotheses that bear on order effects, adjacency effects, and on ad class effects. The serial position effects we hypothesize are expressed in hypotheses 1 and 2 which both focus on ad order.

H<sub>1</sub>: Ads positioned at the beginning of an ad pod will perform better on measures of ad effectiveness than will other ads.

H<sub>2</sub>: Ads positioned at the end of an ad pod will perform better on measures of ad effectiveness than will other ads.

Along with order effects, we proposed competing hypotheses on possible adjacency effects. On the one hand, it is possible that ads will perform better if they are placed adjacent to other similar ads. Specifically, informational ads may perform better when placed in a set of informational ads. Likewise, transformational ads may perform better when placed in a set of transformational ads. One might label these hypothesized results a resonance effect. Sharing a single cognitive or affective orientation, the ads in the set might reciprocally enhance ad responses to other ads in the set.

H<sub>3</sub>: Ads in an ad pod will perform better when they are placed next to other similar ads, i.e., informational ads being placed next to other informational ads and transformational ads being placed next to other transformational ads.

On the other hand, it is possible that the opposite might occur. Ads may perform better when they are placed next to a dissimilar ad, informational ads being placed next to transformational ads and visa versa. This effect would be related to Weber law on stimulus change and might be called a contrast effect since the heightened responses would be evoked by the contrast between the rhetorical styles of adjacent ads.

H<sub>4</sub>: Ads in an ad pod will perform better when they are placed next to other dissimilar ads, i.e., informational ads being placed next to transformational ads and visa versa.

Finally, we offer two competing hypotheses on the relative value of the two main classes of ads evaluated in this study--informational and transformational ads. The hypotheses suggest, alternatively, that one or another of the two main classes of ads identified by Puto and Wells (1983) may be more persuasive.

H<sub>5</sub>: Informational ads are more persuasive than transformational ads.

H<sub>6</sub>: Transformational ads are more persuasive than informational ads.

## METHOD

The subjects in this study were 69 students in introductory business courses at highly selective university in the Midwestern United States. Among these subjects there were 32 females and 37 males. The experiment had a 2 (transformational first\informational first) x 2 (resonance\ contrast) design. In other words, the six ads used in the study were grouped as follows: TTTIII in cell 1, TITITI in cell 2, IIIITT in cell 3, and ITITIT in cell 4, where T and I signify transformational and informational ads. The three transformational ads were for Folgers Coffee, Theragran Vitamins, and the Visa Gold credit card. The three informational ads were for a GE dishwasher, a Dogdge pickup truck, and for Advil pain reliever. These six ads were selected from a set of twelve ads shown to 30 student subjects in a pilot study. The subjects rated each ad on two scales, one measuring the degree to which it was informational, the other the degree to which it was transformational. The six ads in

the study were those which rated highest and lowest on their respective scales. On its own dimension, each set of three ads were rated significantly higher than the alternative set of three ads, a fact that suggests our manipulation of the informational\transformational distinction was adequate.

In each data collection session for the main experiment, subjects were shown a video that began with a 10 minute segment of a 20/20 program from ABC on the marketing of Nike products. One of the four ad pods was then shown, followed by another 20/20 segment on Rollerblades. The 20/20 segments were selected because they were likely to be of interest to college age subjects and because they were consistent with the cover story in the study--that subjects would be quizzed on the topic of marketing ethics. After watching the program segments and the ad pod, subjects filled out a questionnaire that included items on product recall, brand recall, product recognition, brand recognition, ad claim recall, and brand attitude. All recall and recognition items except for ad claim recall were coded 1 if correctly recalled/recognized, 0 if not recalled/recognized. So numbers reported below on brand/product recall/recognition represent the percentages of the products correctly identified. The measure for ad claim recall was the number of ad claims correctly recalled. Brand attitudes were measured on a multi-item 5 point scale that ranged from 1, dislike very much, to 5, like very much. Crobach's alpha for the attitude scales ranged from .95 to .96.

## RESULTS

To test  $H_1$  (the primacy hypothesis) and  $H_2$  (the recency hypothesis), linear and quadratic contrasts in within-subjects ANOVAs were used. The tests compared the performance of ads in first through sixth positions in the ad pod on each of the six dependent variables. In the linear test,  $H_1$ --ads positioned at the beginning of an ad pod will perform better on measures of ad effectiveness than will other ads--was unambiguously supported across the first five dependent variables and ambiguously on the sixth: product recall ( $F = 8.420, p < .005$ ), brand recall ( $F = 8.257, p < .005$ ), product recognition ( $F = 7.174, p < .009$ ), brand recognition ( $F = 6.831, p < .011$ ), ad claim recall ( $F = 5.244, p < .026$ ), and brand attitudes ( $F = 23.284, p < .000$ ). The means for the several dependent variables used to test  $H_1$  are reported in Table 1. On all the recall and recognition items, the first ad performed better than any other ad. On the sixth measure, brand attitude, the significant linear contrast supports the recency hypothesis rather than the primacy hypothesis. However, as reported below, the quadratic contrast was also significant, and that supported the hypothesis of a primacy effect.

Since the primacy effect was stronger than the recency effect on all dependent measures except brand attitude,  $H_2$ --ads positioned at the end of an ad pod will perform better on measures of ad effectiveness than will other ads--was not supported by the linear contrasts with the exception of the last one, as discussed above. It was, however, somewhat ambiguously supported in the quadratic contrasts which were also significant across all six dependent variables: product recall ( $F = 7.976, p < .006$ ), brand recall ( $F = 10.534, p < .002$ ), product recognition ( $F = 19.880, p < .000$ ), brand recognition ( $F = 4.191, p < .045$ ), ad claim recall ( $F = 7.044, p < .010$ ), and brand attitudes ( $F = 7.714, p < .007$ ). An inspection of the means will reveal that the final ad performed better than at least one ad in the middle of the pod. This effect was strong enough to make all quadratic tests significant.

**TABLE 1**

	Product Recall	Brand Recall	Product Recognition	Brand Recognition	Ad Claim Recall	Brand Attitude
First Ad	.71	.65	.94	.85	1.16	3.62
Second Ad	.44	.41	.81	.81	.92	3.34
Third Ad	.29	.29	.71	.71	.60	3.63
Fourth Ad	.45	.36	.72	.72	.89	3.51
Fifth Ad	.45	.39	.66	.63	.64	3.89
Sixth Ad	.38	.38	.84	.73	.83	4.09

To test  $H_3$  (the resonance hypothesis) and  $H_4$  (the contrast hypothesis), the performance of ads in the first two between subjects conditions TTTIII and IIITTT was compared with the performance of those in last two conditions TITITI and ITITIT. Across all six dependent variables, the results of this test were not significant. So  $H_3$ --ads in an ad pod will perform better when they are placed next to other similar ads, i.e., informational ads being placed next to other informational ads and transformational ads being placed next to other transformational ads--was rejected.  $H_4$ --ads in an ad pod will perform better when they are placed next to other dissimilar ads, i.e., informational ads being placed next to transformational ads and visa versa--was likewise rejected. Informational and transformational ads do not appear to produce resonance or contrast effects within ad pods.

To test  $H_5$  (the information superiority hypothesis) and the competing hypothesis,  $H_6$  (the affect superiority hypothesis), the performance of the three informational ads was compared with the performance of the transformational ads across all six dependent measures. On the product and brand recall and recognition measures, there were no significant differences in the responses to the transformational and informational stimuli. Thus, the class of the ad does not seem to affect basic recall and recognition. However, unsurprisingly, subjects were able to recall more ad claims on average from the informational ads (which contained more claims) than from the transformational ads ( $F = 11.103, p < .001$ ). What is more surprising is that subjects were also more persuaded by the rational than by the emotional appeals ( $F = 22.377, p < .000$ ). These results support  $H_5$  and lead to a rejection of  $H_6$ . Means for these tests are reported in Table 2

**TABLE 2**

	Product Recall	Brand Recall	Product Recognition	Brand Recognition	Ad Claim Recall	Brand Attitude
Transformational 1	.75	.68	.89	.88	1.06	3.37
Transformational 2	.30	.23	.67	.67	.29	3.07
Transformational 3	.32	.33	.74	.77	.90	3.88
Informational 1	.56	.46	.90	.78	1.40	3.81
Informational 2	.55	.49	.72	.78	.97	3.80
Informational 3	.39	.29	.77	.89	.59	4.10

## MANAGERIAL IMPLICATIONS

Our study has several important implications for marketing managers. The support for the primacy and recency hypotheses suggests that various positions in an ad pod should be differentially

priced, slots at the beginning and end of an ad pod costing more than those in the middle. At present, prices do not differ, so marketing managers may be able to secure a competitive advantage if they can persuade advertisers to place their ads in initial or final position within a pod.

Our study also suggests that at least for ads to which consumers are likely to have only one or two exposures, informational ads are likely to be more persuasive than transformational ads. While transformational ads receive the bulk of the attention at award time and are more likely to be enjoyed by the public, our results suggest that informational ads may be more effective in actually selling products.

In applying the results of this study, practitioners should keep in mind several limitations. Since the subjects for the study were drawn from a student pool at a highly selective liberal arts university, they may have a higher need for cognition than the typical viewer of a television advertisement. Consequently, they may be more inclined to respond well to informational appeals. The study also contained one confound not entirely controlled by the design. Ads were tested in only three or four of the six possible positions within the ad pod. This means that the order effects were confounded with the effects of particular brands and ad executions to some degree. This problem is not as serious as that in the study by Zhao discussed above since ads were rotated through multiple positions, but it is an important limitation of the study nonetheless.

## REFERENCES

- Edell, J. A. & M. C. Burke (1987), "The Power of Feelings in Understanding Advertising Effects," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 14 (3), 421 - 433.
- Goldberg, M. E. & G. J. Gorn (1987), "Happy and Sad TV Programs: How They Affect Reactions to Commercials," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 14 (3), 387 - 403.
- Hitchon, J. C. & E. Thorson (1995), "Effects of Emotion and Product Involvement on the Experience of Repeated Commercial Viewing," *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 39 (3), 376 - 389.
- Kerr, J., G. Ward, & S. E. Avons (1998), "Response Bias in Visual Serial Order Memory," *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning Memory, and Cognition*, 24 (5), 1316 - 1323.
- Pieters, R. G. M. & T. H. A. Bijmolt (1997), "Consumer Memory for Television Advertising: A Field Study of Duration, Serial Position, and Competition Effects," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 23 (4), 362 - 372.
- Puto, C. P. & W. D. Wells (1983), "Informational and Transformational Advertising: The Differential Effects of Time," *Advances in Consumer Research*, 9, 638 - 643.
- Singh, S. N. & C. A. Cole (1993), "The Effects of Length, Content, and Repetition on Television Commercial Effectiveness," *Journal of Marketing Research*, 30 (1), 91 - 104.
- Zhao, X. (1997), "Clutter and Serial Order Redefined and Retested," *Journal of Advertising Research* 37 (5), 57 - 73.